

Lewis, Eleanor (I)

PENSION RESERVE

Deduction of prior permanent partial disability award (RCW 51.32.080(4)) (Previously RCW 51.32.080(2))

Only the excess of a permanent partial disability award over the amount the worker would have received had he been awarded a pension in the first instance can be deducted from the pension reserve. ...***In re Eleanor Lewis (I)*, BIIA Dec., 86 4139 (1988)** [*Editor's Note*: The Board's decision was appealed to superior court under Skagit County Cause No. 88-2-00145-9. *Overruled, In re Esther Rodriguez*, BIIA Dec., 91 5594 (1993).]; ***In re Wade Chriswell*, BIIA Dec., 43,742 (1974)** [*Editor's Note*: *Overruled to the extent decision is inconsistent with In re Esther Rodriguez*, BIIA Dec., 91 5594 (1993).]

Scroll down for order.

1 At issue is the correctness of the Department's action of charging the sum of \$24,113.49, which
2 had previously been paid the claimant pursuant to a permanent partial disability award, against her
3 pension reserve.
4

5 On February 25, 1982, the Department issued an order closing this claim with a total award for
6 permanent partial disability of \$22,950.00 to be dispersed in the form of an initial cash payment of
7 \$3,038.48, and the balance of \$19,911.52 to be paid at the rate of \$358.51 per month, plus 6%
8 interest per annum on the unpaid balance, pursuant to RCW 51.32.080(4). This order was timely
9 protested by the claimant, and there followed a series of interactions involving both the Department
10 and this Board. Ultimately, the Department's adjudication of permanent partial disability was reversed
11 on appeal to this Board by an Order on Agreement of Parties dated July 18, 1986, which ordered the
12 claimant to be classified as permanently totally disabled effective February 13, 1982. Pursuant to the
13 Board's order, the Department issued an order on July 30, 1986, reclassifying the claimant as a
14 permanently totally disabled worker, and placing her on the pension rolls effective February 13, 1982.
15 The Department further ordered that the sum of \$24,113.49 (representing the total amount of money
16 the claimant had received up to that time pursuant to the Department's prior permanent partial
17 disability adjudication of February 25, 1982) be charged against the claimant's pension reserve, and
18 her monthly pension payments reduced accordingly.
19

20 The situation at hand is squarely governed by the fourth proviso in RCW 51.32.080(2), which
21 provides:
22

23 "...That in case permanent partial disability compensation is followed by
24 permanent total disability compensation, any portion of the permanent
25 partial disability compensation which exceeds the amount that would have
26 been paid the injured worker if total permanent disability had been paid in
27 the first instance, shall be deducted from the pension reserve of such
28 injured worker and his or her monthly compensation payments shall be
29 reduced accordingly." (Emphasis supplied)
30

31 The record establishes that the last monthly permanent partial disability payment to the claimant was
32 on June 6, 1986, and that as of that date she would have received a total of \$22,564.37 in permanent
33 total disability payments had she been awarded a pension back in February, 1982, the date of "first
34 instance", instead of a permanent partial disability award. As previously noted, the permanent partial
35 disability compensation paid to the claimant, including interest, totaled \$24,113.49. Accordingly,
36 applying the plain and unambiguous language of the statute, the "portion of the permanent partial
37 disability compensation which exceeds the amount that would have been paid...if total permanent
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47

1 disability had been paid in the first instance" amounts to \$1,549.12 in this case, and that sum therefore
2 constitutes the charge which is to be properly deducted from the claimant's pension reserve for and on
3 account of the prior permanent partial disability award.
4

5 The Department cites Trayle v. Department of Labor and Industries, 70 Wn.2d 141 (1967), in
6 support of its charge of the entire permanent partial disability compensation against the pension
7 reserve. The issue in Trayle was whether the enactment of RCW 51.32.070, establishing a minimum
8 pension of \$125.00 per month for certain prior pensioners, superseded RCW 51.32.080(2), supra, so
9 as to preclude a reduction in the pension of the claimant therein below \$125.00 per month because of
10 a prior permanent partial disability award. The correctness of the amount of the actual charge made
11 by the Department against the pension reserve because of the prior permanent partial disability award
12 was not even at issue in Trayle. Accordingly, the Department's reliance upon Trayle is misplaced.
13
14
15
16
17

18 In sum, we hold that the correct charge against the claimant's pension reserve in this matter for
19 and on account of the prior permanent partial disability award is \$1,549.12, and the pension reserve
20 and the claimant's monthly compensation payments should be recalculated accordingly.
21

22 We wish to note some further matters which, although technically not in issue before us in this
23 appeal, will enter into the Department's recalculations on remand. In August 1986, shortly following
24 issuance of its order of July 30, 1986, the Department sent the claimant the sum of \$4,419.40,
25 purportedly representing retroactive "pension benefits" for the period of February 13, 1982, to August
26 15, 1986. This sum represents an overpayment to the claimant, inasmuch as it is clear that for the
27 period from February 13, 1982 through June 6, 1986, the claimant had already received what would
28 have been full compensation under permanent total disability status, plus \$1,549.12 in excess. On the
29 other hand, for the period from August 15, 1986 forward, the Department has been underpaying the
30 claimant, by reason of its excessive charge against the pension reserve, and the consequent
31 excessive reduction in claimant's monthly payments. These respective overpayments and
32 underpayments must of course be readjusted in the Department's administrative recalculations. And
33 finally, the amount of the pension reserve necessary to fund the claimant's pension payments, and
34 from which the amount of \$1,549.12 should be deducted and claimant's monthly pension reduced
35 accordingly, should be, it seems to us, calculated on annuity values for the claimant as of June 6,
36 1986.
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47

1 **FINDINGS OF FACT**

2 Findings Nos. 1, 2, 3, and 4 of the Proposed Decision and Order entered in this matter on June
3 29, 1987 are hereby adopted by the Board and incorporated by this reference as the Board's Findings
4 Nos. 1, 2, 3, and 4. In addition, the Board finds:
5
6

- 7 5. As of June 6, 1986, the claimant had received a total of \$24,113.49 in
8 permanent partial disability compensation, including interest, whereas she
9 would have received a total of \$22,564.37 in pension payments had she
10 been classified as a permanently totally disabled worker instead of a
11 permanently partially disabled worker back in February, 1982.
12

13 **CONCLUSIONS OF LAW**

- 14 1. The Board of Industrial Insurance Appeals has jurisdiction of the parties
15 and subject matter of this appeal.
16
17 2. That portion of the permanent partial disability compensation paid to the
18 claimant which exceeds the amount she would have been paid had she
19 been classified as a permanently and totally disabled worker in the first
20 instance is \$1,549.12, which constitutes the amount to be charged against
21 the claimant's pension reserve pursuant to the fourth proviso in RCW
22 51.32.080(2).
23
24 3. The order of the Department of Labor and Industries dated October 17,
25 1986, adhering to its order of July 30, 1986, insofar as it calculates the
26 claimant's pension based upon a charge to her pension reserve of
27 \$24,113.49, should be reversed, and this claim remanded to the
28 Department with instructions to recalculate the claimant's pension based
29 upon a charge of \$1,549.12 to her pension reserve, with the remaining
30 \$22,564.37 of the permanent partial disability compensation previously
31 paid to the claimant to be credited and offset against the retroactive
32 pension compensation otherwise due the claimant.

33 It is so ORDERED.

34 Dated this 28th day of January, 1988.

35 BOARD OF INDUSTRIAL INSURANCE APPEALS

36 /S/
37 SARA T. HARMON Chairperson

38 /S/
39 FRANK E. FENNERTY, JR. Member

40 /S/
41 PHILLIP T. BORK Member